

PO Box 72049 Sasamat RPO Vancouver, BC V6R 4P2

www.cupj.ca cupj@cupj.ca Mildred Dresselhaus Chair, Governing Board American Institute of Physics One Physics Ellipse College Park, Maryland 20740

cc: Members of the AIP Governing Board

Dear Dr. Dresselhaus,

As former and current editors of the *Canadian Undergraduate Physics Journal (CUPJ)*, we are writing to you to protest your efforts to prevent people from reading critical parts of an interview article published in the January 2006 issue of *CUPJ*. We consider the American Institute of Physics's actions to be disrespectful towards the many volunteer Canadian physics students giving their time to create three quality issues of *CUPJ* every year.

Parts of the interview, titled "Thoughts from an undisciplined mind", were whited out on the http://disciplinedminds.com website, which is where you censored it as a condition for settling the dispute over your firing of AIP employee Jeff Schmidt. The settlement document posted on the web lists our article among "Material specified by the American Institute of Physics for removal from the <code>Disciplined Minds</code> website." We believe there is no justification for hiding from any specific audience the contents of the article published in <code>CUPJ</code>.

For example, one sentence that is whited out on http://disciplinedminds.com/cupj-censored.pdf, but could be read in the uncensored version at http://cupj.ca/0402_schmidt.pdf, criticizes AIP's Physics Today magazine for treating the development of nuclear weapons as something to be celebrated. Isn't the content of Physics Today magazine a legitimate issue for discussion within the physics community? Shouldn't the American Institute of Physics welcome such critical thought regarding the discipline it represents, rather than suppress it and stifle discussion?

The *CUPJ* article that you censored received praise from the *CUPJ* editorial board, which understands that an important role of any publication is criticism of the establishment in its own field. Your organization never contacted *CUPJ* or the article's author, Sean Kelly, who joins in this protest.

If your organization disagrees with the content of an article, we believe it should defend its point of view in a letter to the editor, to be printed in a future issue of *CUPJ*. We see this as the legitimate way to pursue debate while respecting the freedom of the press to publish individual opinions on any organization, including the AIP. Before we bring this matter to the attention of the physics community in Canada and beyond, we wish to give you the opportunity to remedy the problem. We look forward to your prompt action.

Sincerely,

Philippe Marchand Editor-in-Chief, 2005-2006

David Nataf English Language Editor, 2005-2006

Jeff Mottershead Distribution Manager, 2005-2007

Sean Kelly Contributor Marie-Michèle Limoges Editor-in-Chief, 2006-2007

Stephanne Taylor

English Language Editor, 2006-2007

Shannon Wang

Production Manager, 2006-2007

Gigi Wong

Managing Editor, 2006-2007